

# THE PHILLIPS-JACKSON REDEVELOPMENT DISTRICT PLAN DESIGN GUIDELINES FOR HISTORIC PROPERTIES

## INTRODUCTION

Three National Register-listed historic properties are located in the Phillips-Jackson Street Redevelopment District. The properties are the Germantown and Buena Vista Historic Districts and the John Geist and Sons Blacksmith Shop. These properties are national treasures which are irreplaceable. While the National Register listing provides recognition of an area's historic and architectural value, it provides no protection from demolition or incompatible development or additions. The following design guidelines are intended to help preserve a link to Nashville's past through the covenants of the Phillips-Jackson Street Redevelopment District Plan (hereinafter "Plan") and through the building permitting process.

The "Phillips-Jackson Redevelopment District Plan Design Guidelines for Historic Properties" (hereinafter "Guidelines") are rules and standards developed for use by the MDHA Design Review Committee (hereinafter "Committee") for review of certain building permit applications in the Phillips-Jackson Street Redevelopment District. The boundaries of the specific areas in which the Guidelines are to be applied are shown on the attached map (R.P. Map 4) and include properties within the Germantown and Buena Vista National Register Historic Districts, the National Register-listed John Geist and Sons Blacksmith Shop, and the National Register-eligible Nashville Union Stockyard at 901 2nd Avenue North. If additional properties are listed in or deemed eligible for the National Register while the covenants of the Plan are in effect, the Guidelines are also applicable for review of permit applications for those properties. The Guidelines shall also apply in portions of the Plan area where the Metro Historical Commission (MHC) determines that adjacent building activities may adversely affect National Register-listed or -eligible properties.

As authorized in the Plan, the Guidelines, outlined in Part I on the following pages, are to be used by the Committee for the review of new developments (new construction, construction of accessory buildings, and relocation of buildings) and habitable additions to the floor areas of existing historical buildings. The Guidelines apply to all vacant lots as shown in R.P. Map 3 and to all individually listed or eligible properties and all historic structures which contribute to the significance of the historic districts (See R.P. Map 4). The Guidelines do not apply to existing structures that are not historic and do not contribute to the significance of the historic districts. These non-contributing properties, shown on R.P. Map 4, will be reviewed under the "General Regulations and Controls" (Section C.2.b.) of the Plan.

When the Guidelines are applied to new development or additions to the floor areas of historic buildings, the word "shall" is always mandatory and is not discretionary. The word "should" means "strongly recommended" and can be overridden only by majority vote of the Committee. Petitioners may make a presentation and justification to the Committee.

Part II of the Guidelines (Section 5.00) may also be used by the Committee for review of permit requests for renovation of contributing historic buildings in the historic districts. In these cases, the Guidelines will serve as recommendations for properties deemed worthy of conservation by the MHC (See R.P. Map 4). Projects not requiring a work permit are NOT subject to review.

## PART I GUIDELINES FOR HISTORIC PROPERTIES

### 1.00 GUIDELINES FOR NEW CONSTRUCTION

#### 1.10 Definition:

1.11 NEW CONSTRUCTION consists of building from the ground up on a currently vacant parcel of land or building an accessory structure on an occupied lot.

#### 1.20 General Principles:

1.21 The Section 1.00 guidelines apply only to the exteriors of newly constructed primary and accessory buildings.

1.22 Construction in the subject historic districts has taken place continuously from the mid-nineteenth through the early twentieth centuries and a variety of building styles and types have resulted. Referencing the contributing historic structures, new buildings may continue this tradition while complementing and being compatible with other buildings in the area. Also, because of the variety of building designs, more flexibility in design is possible than might be the case for more architecturally homogeneous historic neighborhoods.

1.23 New structures should not imitate past architectural styles.

1.24 Because new buildings should relate to an established pattern and rhythm of existing buildings, both on the same and opposite sides of the street, a dominance of the pattern and rhythm should be respected and should not be disrupted.

1.25 New construction should be consistent with existing buildings along a street in terms of height, scale, setback, and rhythm; relationship of materials, texture, and color; roof shape; orientation; and proportions and rhythm of openings.

#### 1.30 Specific Design Principles:

1.31 Height: New buildings shall be constructed to a height which is compatible with the height of adjacent buildings. (*Generally, this means that buildings are limited to one to two stories in height. However, special features of limited height such as towers and turrets may be acceptable\*.*) Slab foundations are generally not appropriate for primary buildings on a site.

1.32 Scale: The size of a building, its mass in relation to open spaces, and its windows, door openings and porches should be visually compatible with the surrounding buildings.

1.33 Setback and Rhythm of Spacing: The setback from front and side yard property lines shall be compatible with those found on the street. When a definite rhythm

---

\* *Italicized sections of the guidelines contain explanatory text.*

along a street is established by uniform lot *and* building width, infill construction shall maintain that rhythm.

- 1.34 **Relationship of Materials, Texture, Details and Material Color:** The relationship and use of materials, texture, details and material color of a new building's public facades shall be visually compatible with and similar to those of adjacent buildings, or shall not contrast conspicuously. (*Predominant building materials consist of brick and clapboard siding. Encouraged are traditional brick colors such as dark red. The use of "antique" reproduction or multi-colored brick is strongly discouraged. Wood clapboard generally has an exposure of 4" to 5 1/2". Paint colors on wood siding are not reviewed.*)
- 1.35 **Roof Shape:** The roofs of new buildings should be visually compatible by not contrasting greatly with the roof shape, pitch, and orientation of surrounding buildings. (*Predominant roof shapes are gables and hips with slopes ranging from 40 to 60 degrees.*)
- 1.36 **Orientation:** The primary facade orientation of new buildings should be consistent with that of adjacent buildings and should be visually compatible.
- 1.37 **Proportion and Rhythm of Openings:** The relationship of width to height of windows and doors and the rhythm of solids (*walls*) to voids (*windows/doors*) in new buildings should be compatible with surrounding buildings. (*Windows and exterior doors are generally tall and narrow in proportion. Doors are typically 7' in height and have transoms.*)
- 1.38 **Outbuildings:** Garages and storage buildings should reflect the character of the existing house and/or adjacent historic outbuildings and should be compatible in terms of height, scale, roof shape, materials, texture and details. (*These buildings may have a more "utilitarian" design character than the main structure.*) The location and design of outbuildings should not be visually disruptive to the character of the surrounding buildings. Pre-fabricated buildings will be carefully reviewed for appropriateness.
- 1.39 **Appurtenances:** Appurtenances related to new buildings, including driveways, sidewalks, lighting, fences, and walls should be visually compatible with the environment of the existing buildings and sites to which they relate.

## **2.00 GUIDELINES FOR RELOCATION**

### **2.10 Definition:**

2.11 RELOCATION is the moving of a building in either historic district to another location within the district, the moving of a building to a new site outside of either district, or the moving of a building into either historic district from outside the district

### **2.20 General Principles:**

- 2.21 Within either historic district, the relocation of an existing building which retains architectural and historic integrity and which contributes to the architectural and historical character of the district is strongly discouraged unless it is in certain danger of demolition.
- 2.22 The moving of a building out of either historic district which does not contribute to the historical and architectural integrity of the district or which has lost its architectural integrity due to deterioration or neglect shall be appropriate if its removal or the proposal for its replacement will result in a more positive, appropriate visual effect on the district.
- 2.23 The moving of an existing building from outside of the historic district into the district shall be appropriate if the building retains architectural and historic integrity and is compatible with the general architectural character of the district. Styles dating from the 1840s through the 1920s are appropriate.
- 2.24 The use of prefabricated or portable buildings is discouraged. The design, materials and placement of all prefab or portable buildings requiring a building permit for installation shall be carefully evaluated as to its appropriateness.
- 2.30 Guidelines for Relocation:
- 2.31 Relocated buildings should be carefully renovated to retain and maintain original architectural details and materials.
- 2.32 A building may be moved into either historic district if it maintains a sense of architectural unity in terms of style, height, scale, massing, materials, texture, and setback with existing buildings along the street.
- 2.33 A building may be moved from one site to another within either historic district if:
- a. the integrity of the location and setting of the building in its original location has been lost or is seriously threatened;
  - b. the new location will be similar in setting and siting;
  - c. the building will be compatible with the buildings adjacent to the new location in style, height, scale, material, and setback; and
  - d. the relocation of the building will not result in a negative visual effect on the site and surrounding buildings from which it will be removed.

### **3.00 GUIDELINES FOR ADDITIONS TO EXISTING HISTORIC BUILDINGS**

#### **3.10 Definition:**

3.11 An ADDITION consists of an extension to an existing structure that increases the floor area or height of that structure. Additions are areas that increase the living or working space of a structure.

#### **3.20 General Principles:**

3.21 Contemporary design for additions are acceptable when such alterations or additions do not destroy significant architectural, historical, or cultural material, and when such design is compatible with the size, scale, material, and character of the property, neighborhood, and environment.

3.22 Whenever possible, new additions should be done in such a manner that if such additions were to be removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the original structure would not be impaired.

#### **3.30 Guidelines:**

3.31 Location of Additions: An addition should generally be situated at the rear of the building in such a way that it will not disturb either the front or side facades.

3.32 Height and Scale: Additions should be compatible with and should not exceed the height and mass of the primary building.

3.33 Roof: The pitch and configuration of the roof and dormers of the primary structure should be maintained in the addition. Skylights should be located on the non-public sides of the addition.

3.34 Doors and Windows: Size, shape, number, and placement of doors and windows in additions should harmonize with those of primary structure.

3.35 Facing Materials: Facing material should replicate or compliment that of the primary building.

## 00 GUIDELINES FOR DEMOLITION

### 4.10 Definition:

4.11 DEMOLITION is the tearing down of a building or a portion of a building.

### 4.20 General Principle:

4.21 Since one of the goals of the redevelopment plan is to preserve historic buildings, the demolition of a building or portion of a building which contributes historically or architecturally to the character and significance of the district is inappropriate and is strongly discouraged.

### 4.30 Guidelines:

4.31 Demolition is inappropriate:

- a. if a building or portion of a building is of such architectural or historical interest and value that its removal would be detrimental to the public interest;
- b. if a building or portion of a building is of such old or unusual or uncommon design and materials that it could not be reproduced without great difficulty and expense; or
- c. if its proposed replacement would make a less positive visual contribution to the district, and would disrupt the character of the district, or would be visually incompatible.

4.32 Demolition is appropriate:

- a. if a building or portion of a building has lost its architectural and historical integrity and importance and if its removal will not negatively impact the district;
- b. if a building or portion of a building does not contribute to the architectural and historical character and importance of the district (*non-contributing building as shown on R.P. Map 4*) and its removal will result in a positive impact on the district; or
- c. if the denial of the demolition will result in an economic hardship in accordance with Section 91.65 of the Historic Zoning Ordinance of The Metropolitan Government of Nashville-Davidson County.

## PART II RECOMMENDATIONS

### 5.00 RECOMMENDATIONS FOR RENOVATION OF EXISTING HISTORIC BUILDINGS (shown as contributing or National Register-listed or -eligible on R.P. Map 4)

#### 5.10 Definition:

5.11 RENOVATION consists of a change in building material; the addition or elimination of any architectural feature of a structure or a repair that reconstructs any part of an existing building.

#### 5.20 General Principles:

5.21 These guidelines apply to the exteriors of buildings only.

5.22 Proposals for exterior work to be done on public facades-(facades *visible from the street*) should be more carefully reviewed than that to be done on non-public facades. Non-public facades are those not visible from the street.

5.23 The distinguishing qualities or character of a building, structure, or site and its environment should not be destroyed. The removal or alteration of any historic material or distinctive architectural features should be avoided.

5.24 Changes which may have taken place over the course of time are evidence of the history and development of a building, structure, or site and its environment. These changes may have acquired significance in their own right, and this significance should be recognized and respected. Conversely, the removal of inappropriate additions is encouraged.

5.25 Distinctive stylistic features or examples of skilled craftsmanship which characterize a building, structure, or site should be treated with sensitivity.

5.26 Deteriorated architectural features should be repaired rather than replaced whenever possible. In the event replacement is necessary, the new material should match the material being replaced in composition, design, texture, and other visual qualities. Repair or replacement of missing architectural features should be based on accurate duplications of features, substantiated by historic, physical, or pictorial evidence.

5.27 The surface cleaning of structures should be undertaken with the gentlest means possible. Sandblasting, high-pressure water cleaning, and other cleaning methods that damage historic building materials should not be used

### 5.3 Recommendations:

5.31 Roof: Features may include, but are not limited to overhangs, cornices, rafters, cresting, gutter systems, brackets, finials, pendants, vents and chimneys. In planning any renovation work these features should be retained and consideration should be given to the following:

- a. The original pitch and configuration should be maintained
- b. The original size and shape of dormers should be maintained.
- c. The original roof materials and color should be maintained
- d. Skylights should be located on the non-public sides of the roof or in new additions.

5.32 Porch Features: Porch features may include columns, railings, balustrades, brackets, cornices, ceilings, floors, and steps.

- a. Outline, roof height, and roof pitch should be maintained.
- b. Original porch materials and architectural features should be maintained. If different materials are substituted, they should be a close visual approximation of the original.
- c. Enclosing front porches is inappropriate.
- d. Enclosing side porches may be appropriate if the visual openness and character of the porch is maintained.

nfi

5.33 Windows: Features may include sash, trim, number and configuration of lights, frames, hoods, and lintels.

- a. The original size and shape of windows should be maintained.
- b. The original number and arrangement of panes should be maintained. New window openings should not be introduced unless they match the existing window configuration and their placement harmonizes with the existing rhythm of openings.
- d. Original windows should not be filled in.
- e. Shutters, where appropriate to the building style, should fit an opening in height and width so that, if they were closed, the opening would be covered.
- f. Raw aluminum storm sash, screens, and doors are not appropriate. "Blind stop" storm windows, painted to match the sash, are appropriate.

5.34 Door: Features may include panels, trim, transoms, sidelights and number and configuration of lights.

- a. The original size and shape of door openings should be maintained
- b. Original transoms, side lights, and doors should be maintained-
- c. Replacement doors should be compatible with original doors in terms of style and materials.
- d. Original door openings should not be filled in.
- e. Security doors are acceptable.

5.35 **Architectural Features:** Original architectural features should not be removed.

- a. Irreparable features should be replaced with close visual approximations of the originals.
- b. Architectural features of any period or style not original to the building should not be introduced.

5.36 **Facing Materials**

- a. Original building materials should be retained, if possible. If replacement is necessary, it should be with original materials or close visual approximations of the original. Original wood siding should be retained and should not be covered or replaced with a material or texture not original to the building, such as aluminum or vinyl siding. Replacement wood siding should be consistent with the original in size, direction, and lap dimension.
- b. For buildings: wood, stone, terra cotta and stucco.
- c. For roofs, metal, slate, wood shingles and asphalt (fiberglass) shingles.
- d. Masonry: Repointing should be done with care to match the original mortar color. Portland cement can damage historic brick and should not be used. Soft lime-based mortars are more appropriate for use with historic brick. Original tooling configuration and joint width and depth should be maintained.

5.37 **General Recommendations**

- a. Every reasonable effort should be made to protect and preserve archaeological resources, affected by, or adjacent to any large redevelopment project.
- b. Appurtenances, including driveways, sidewalks, lighting, fences and walls added or changed on existing occupied lots should be visually compatible with the environments of the existing buildings and sites to which they relate.

PREPARED BY THE MDHA DEVELOPMENT OFFICE, SEPTEMBER 1994.

# Phillips Jackson Street Redevelopment Plan

R.P. Map No. 4

## HISTORIC PROPERTIES

- Redevelopment Plan Boundaries
- National Register-Listed or Eligible Properties
- Contributing to historic district
- Non-contributing to historic district
- Vacant land in historic district

1994



Germantown Historic District

Buena Vista Historic District

Geist & Sons Blacksmith Shop

Stockyard